Contributor	Comment	Response
General	There are shadows from the ropes. There are no chapter points	We will re-shoot the scenes with better lighting. When we re-edit the DVD we will divide it into chapters. This will help people find a particular point much more quickly
Philippa Penney Penney	I think it will be a very useful aid to people at this point in the learning curve. I particularly found the bits on call changes good. I am not sure whether people can appreciate the significance of the numbers when you are talking about the 3 speeds of ringing. Obviously it is an important point to get over but the concept of the difference between 2 seconds and 1 and two thirds seconds is beyond my grasp. I liked the slow motion.	Yes. We will see if this can be rephrased or put a different way
Pauline Dingley	… because of the huge challenge of getting and retaining school recruits. The website and teaching aids will be tremendously useful with committed youngsters keen to progress in ringing, but I regret to say we did not reach that stage. We have a few comments on the DVD, which I hope may be useful. It is very impressive to have actually got this off the ground, as there is obviously much work involved: Introduction - could be more of what will be covered in the DVD, how the learner will use it and indeed what change ringing is. The list of prerequisite skills is quite threatening and rather off-putting - breaking this section down a bit might stop the learner giving up now. Call changes - good emphasis on the importance of change of speed. Knowing what place you are in is very difficult for a learner - could be expanded to show how to get this skill. Plain hunt - good explanation. It is easy for the learner to get confused about whether they are being told places or which number bell to follow, so I think the commentary needs to stick very carefully to saying first, second, third for places and one (or treble), two, three for the numbers of the bells. Plain hunting to a method does not mention dodges, so needs to emphasise that the learner is meant to be watching the treble, not trying to work out what the other bells are doing. Overall we felt that it might make more impact with a professional narrator, the sections could be more clearly highlighted, perhaps with "bookmarks" at the end of each chapter to allow the student to stop, go back and replay. Many learners will not be learning in the ideal tower (where eg changes are consistently called up) so there could be a little more encouragement and recognition that these are high standards and ideals, which may not always be met in practice.	We will consider including a more gentle introduction We will take out the reference to which bell you are following and concentrate on change of speed and which place the bell is being rung in. We will get someone else to do the narration We will include a little more about calling down and inconsistent calling.
John Harrison	I promised some comments. They are based on watching it once a few weeks ago, and making some semi legible notes at the time, so might not be entirely coherent. As a concept, it is clearly breaking important ground. Integrating theory and demonstration seems a promising approach. I suspect that the material will need some restructuring to cater for the needs of real trainees learning (as opposed to experts desire to describe what we know). The span from start to end is quite wide	We will break it into chapters when we re-edit.

	in terms of the time it takes someone to progress, therefore perhaps it should be designed for viewing at different phases of development, with different entry points, and opportunities for more demonstration and/or explanation if required at different viewings. On a DVD player, that would be based on track numbers + a crib sheet, but if viewed on a PC, it could offer clickable options.	
	An alternative approach would be to split the material into smaller modules, which then might be of a size that they could be downloaded individually as required. It would make it easier to develop them progressively, and is closer to what I seem to recall was your original idea.	We will look into putting individual chapters on the internet, downloadable as streaming video
	Adding graphic cues to the video displays would make them far more effective as learning aids. In many cases, the skill needed to translate your words and integrate them with the visual scene are comparable to the skill that you are hoping to teach. Pointers would overcome that barrier.	Improving the graphics is something we will work on, but may not come until the video is professionally re-made.
	Many of the things I noted down were niggles, which is only to be expected in a first attempt. For example, there were some things that you explained after you had already referred to them. I won't try to list everything, just the more important ones (that I can remember what my notes meant).	
	The slow motion shots of a bell ringing didn't have any sound, and the clapper wasn't actually visible when it struck the bell. There might be a technical reason why sound isn't possible, in which case there ought to be some sort of superimposed visual effect to show when it occurs.	It's difficult to incorporate sound on slow-motion. We will shoot a scene with a clapper hitting the bell from a different angle and then show it as 'picture in picture'.
	You seem divided about listening and looking. Your explanatory words seem intended to encourage listening (good) but when it came to the illustrations, the direction seemed more reliant on looking at the ropes (not good). Similarly with call changes, you start explaining about place, but then with the illustration get sucked into lots of detail about who to follow.	We will take out the reference to which bell you are following and concentrate on change of speed and which place the bell is being rung in.
	You talk about progressing from call changes to hunting on 3, 4, 5. Why no mention of Kaleidoscope (by name or by description)? Why no mention of hunting on 6, given that most learners are in 6 bell towers, and you have 6 bells for your demonstrations?	We will include some Kaleidoscope exercises in the next edition. Time prevented us including hunting on six.
	You explain about three speeds, and the need to pull more or less (good) but the accompanying illustration is all about seeing ropes, not about pulling, feeling the bell rise, checking, etc.	We will include a scene showing a ringer changing speed
	In the plain hunt illustration, you recite a string of numbers (alternately place and bell being followed). It would be far more effective to recite the places, and superimpose a pointer to the rope in question (or even better some sort of relative pointer between it and 'your' bell'). Doing that would: reduce the verbal load, focus the listener on places, encourage the viewer to develop ropesight as a visual skill (not an attempt to remember bell numbers).	We will take out the reference to which bell you are following and concentrate on change of speed and which place the bell is being rung in.
	The ropesight section is an example of being out of step, since the previous illustrations are meaningless unless the viewer has acquired some sort of vestigial ropesight.	
	I think you defined ropesight as being able to spot who you are following. That is only one, rather narrow, aspect, and it also helps to encourage a bell following mentality. 'Being able to make sense of what is happening around you by looking at the ropes' would be a better definition.	We will beef up the seeing the umber of ropes approach. Adding some stills or freeze frame is probably a good way of doing this.
	I was disappointed to see you repeating the 'follow the bell that follows you' idea as a way of acquiring ropesight. If you can see who is following you, then you have already acquired ropesight, in which case why waste half the time looking 'backwards' at what	

	has happened, rather than at what is about to happen. Better approaches are based on seeing the number of bells in front of you (or behind, near the back) and seeing yourself 'pass' another bell. Both of these work for going up or down, and both encourage looking at the ropes, rather than at a rope. The demonstration needs better visualisation, which could be achieved with some graphic superposition, either on the video clips if that is possible, or otherwise on a series of stills. I had more comments on the later parts, but I was running out of time, so I would need another viewing to be sure I was putting them over accurately. Overall, I am sure there is scope for more things like this using new media, and focused directly on the learner. I suspect that getting it right will take quite a lot of effort. Hope these comments help. If I can find a way to view it again, I will send you any more comments that arise.	
Heather Peachey	The DVD is good, and I have a few comments to make now I have had a few days to consider it. 1. There are a few minor 'typo' errors in the text (you've prb already spotted these) and some timing issues with text/video. 2. It needs splitting up into discrete numbered sections with a typical DVD menu - the whole as it is, is more than one lesson long. As a tutor I really like the idea of being able to refer a student to a particular short section for homework/reinforcement. 3. More is of course needed and I have some ideas based on what I've tried to do myself (but not of terribly high quality) a. Leading. Needs to be filmed ideally showing the treble's actions with a good view of the tenor. Needs to point out that there are a number of 'aids' to good leading and that the learner has to practise to develop the skill of using these. Two sections would be useful here, one using rounds on different numbers of bells to show the skill is no different, and another using the artificial set-up (explained that it was a training aid) of the treble constantly leading while the back 5 ring doubles, thus showing the skills needed for steady leading in methods without a tenor cover. The aids I see are: i. looking at the tenor rope/hands for a rough guide ii. listening to the tenor 'bong' as this co-incides pretty much with the emphatic point at the bottom of the treble's pull (this gets you closer) iii. listening to and remembering a good model (Abel perhaps) and critically making fine adjustments in your own performance to emulate it. b. Plain hunt/developing ropesight. I had some success with filming 120 of PB5 from just above the treble's head so that their hands were in the shot, but the rest of the ropes were seen from absolutely the treble's point of view. I edited (not very well!) the film to add a label saying "2nds", "3rds", "lead" etc in front of the bell being followed at the material time. This went down very well with the lady whose difficulty at this stage prompted the experiment. I ran the sequence twice, once with the labels, then without. c. Gordon Lucas's "Kaleidoscope" system which is excellent for teaching the concept of "Place" and developing the physical skills for smooth moving between places. It is an alternative to call changes which we use in addition. It is particularly good for when there are insufficient good ringers present to provide a strong	Noted Will do We will try including a shot of leading from a different angle We will include some shots of plain hunting from this angle We will include some Kaleidoscope exercises in the next edition

	framework for method ringing too, as quite complex work can be practised in isolation to keep the better ringers entertained whilst a less experienced pair are making simple places round each other. A video of how it works would be very useful. d. Covering behind - a much underused skill in the teaching of ringing. We realised years ago that male learners who got lots of early practise at this before they moved on to plain hunt seemed to develop ropesight very easily. We are fortunate enough to have a light 6 and now actively teach every learner who's physically strong enough to cover at the earliest opportunity. Some kids aren't big enough, but they tend to be quicker on the uptake and greater risk-takers too, so move on to plain hunt more easily anyway. We make sure they do learn to cover when a bit bigger/stronger. We first teach people to cover 100% by listening, then to look as a secondary issue and observe which bells are being followed. We've found it is excellent preparation for ropesight development. (We often get adults to ring 2nd cover to PB4 for their 1st QP for rhythm/handling consolidation, then to ring cover to doubles for the 2nd).	This is fine where the tenor is light/easy going, but I'm not keen on including covering because it can do a lot of harm where the tenor is heavy or not easy going, or the ringer is not up to it physically.
David	I have just watched it through and think it excellent. Just two comments: 1. I played it on my computer and found the sound a bit mushy, this may be my equipment but it is not a problem I normally get. 2. I wonder if you spent enough time on the concept of "place"? I find this most difficult to get across to learners, especially those who have spent some time ringing call changes where they haven't a clue what place they are in unless they're leading.	Probably your equipment. I'll beef up the concept of place (see comments above).
Mischa Thompson	Thank you so much for sending the DVD. I have not had time to see it all but what I have seen is brilliant. Let us hope that it will help my friend to progress. I will let you know when she can do her first touch.!	
Andrew Fawbert	I thought the DVD explained the plain hunting very well both in the theory and the actual ringing. The shot of the bell striking as the hands move in front of the face will be useful as I've tried to make this point to a couple of my local band. I'll show the disc to a few less experienced ringers and pass on their comments. A couple of suggestions would be to include a chapter index so that certain parts can be re-shown without having to rewind, and maybe an explanation of what handling skills are required to strike earlier - catching the sally slightly higher and shortening the tail end. I was taught that before being able to ring larger bells. I look forward to future DVD's	Will do. Will include some shots of a ringer doing this.
Dr T Simon Futers	I think that it what is needed to extend form the Central Council Bell handling video. Although the CC video is intended for instructors, I found it useful to show to learners. Your DVD is correctly aimed at the learner, I suspect it is better if it could easily be separated into chapters so that the learner only watches the section on call changes and then masters that before watching the next section. I like the way you have managed to find a tower where you can	Will do We will try and do this, and also

	film the ropes that appear in a straight line. Is it possible to move the camera slightly to separate 5 and 6 a little more? I also found the lighting in the tower a little strange. Although I imagine that when you are showing the text you wanted to keep it clear and simple, I think that it is little too basic in appearance and could be improved. Some of the latter text is better. Another problem is the narration. Sorry if it you. It was very clear, but I felt it was a bit monotoned. It would be easier to listen to if it sounded a little more enthusiastic. I liked the way you showed a ringer pulling the rope and switched to the bell swinging. Would it be better if the swing bell was brought in on the sided of the ringer so that you could see both at the same time? I will also try and get some feedback from some of our learners. Overall I think that you have made an excellent job of the DVD and it is exactly what is needed to speed up the learning process.	include some footage taken from behind the treble. It is quite easy to change typeface. I will try and get someone to help with graphic input. Yes it was me. Will try another narrator. Also better microphone. Will do
Pam Ebsworth	DVD received and viewed with interest. I think it may help people to get to grips with ropesight which seems to be major stumbling block in most towers that I visit. Older ringers don't move on so quickly and this often results in their reliance upon numbers.	
Chris Baxter	I've been trying to put a few thoughts together about the learn2ring website proposal but sadly my other work has tended to get in the way a little at the moment!! However hopefully these little points may help from a pro-designers point of view 1. Get rid of the frames, they are a nasty work around a problem inherent in early browsers of not being able to separate content and navigation, CSS and active server pages make this obsolete, plus most search engines just do not like framed content and can lead to some awful problems in a site is opened as a frame within a frame. 2. Colours, The demo site has a coat of many colours, mainly blue, I think you may need to think about a more 'corporate image' kind of feel, certainly the site needs to look professional, a good eye-catching logo would be good that could be used in all fields, think of the Coca Cola, Virgin, Orange kind of thing, in fact Orange is a great example, I know the design house that tried to sell the Orange brand and the square for years, suddenly Hutchinson Telecom decided they wanted to get into mobile phones and rang around a few design houses and the rest is history, Orange is now one of the most recognized brands. 3. Accessibility. The site should be accessible by all, careful coding with CSS should help with this but more and more equal access groups are targeting websites that don't conform to standards. 4. Dbase the site must be database driven so that content can be updated by 'content managers' without upsetting the styling of the site. 5. animation. Only use where it is needed to illustrate a point. 6. Flash. Use it very sparingly, Even Macromedia only have a couple of Flash bits on their website	

	7. Easy feedback. It would be good to encourage visitors to relate their experience of the site or ringing, some kind of ongoing Blog may be good. 8. .com. To be honest I do have very personal feelings against a .com tld, many search engines still (and probably always will) lump .com as being a USA based site, .com sites (again my personal experience) suffer more spam, DoS and hacking attacks then most other tld. I'm just not sold on this at all, isn't learn2ring.org free? Or even learn2ring.co.uk? Learn2ring.org.uk may be better. 9. Hosting. The hosting supplier should be a no ads host. 10. Development over time. Very bad idea, I think that you should have a core minimum standard that the site must reach before it is launched, if the idea is to get people to ring then at launch there should be a/ why ring b/ how easy is it c/ the basics of handling d/ controlling the bell e/ ringing with other ringers f/ basic bell movement g/ where do I go to get all this? Nothing turns some surfers away from a site quicker then 'Under construction' notices, plus many search engines will blacklist sites that have anything like this as content. I think that this is the minimum content that you could launch with, more is good but you need to present a 'mature' site but at the same time being careful about 'spec creep' as in we've got this far but wouldn't it be nice to have this in as well. May think of more as I keep looking at the demo site but I hope that this will help a little (if not then feel free to press delete, you know me, I won't be upset) sadly at the moment I am too busy to offer much in the way of practical help though I may be able to host if need be.	